

January | 2015

# Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

Submitted to the Economic Development & Justice Giving Circle of the  
Women's Foundation of California (EDJe)  
San Francisco, CA

Prepared by Amy Rassen  
[amy@rassenassociates.org](mailto:amy@rassenassociates.org)  
415-652-4533

## Table of Contents

<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>2 Background Information</b>	<b>6</b>
2.1 Who Is Trafficked and Where They Come From	6
2.2 Types of Trafficking	6
2.3 Human Trafficking Definitions	7
2.3.1 Palermo Protocol	7
2.3.2 United States Trafficking Victims Protection Act	7
2.3.3 California	8
<b>3 Business of Domestic Sex Trafficking</b>	<b>9</b>
3.1 Traffickers	9
3.2 Customers	10
3.3 Victims	10
3.3.1 Legal Status	10
3.3.2 Characteristics	10
3.3.3 Work	11
3.3.4 Numbers	11
3.3.5 Child Victim Examples	12
3.4 Scope of Illegal Activity	13
3.5 How It Works	13
<b>4 Governmental Response</b>	<b>13</b>
4.1 Federal	13
4.2 California	14
4.2.1 Regional Anti-Human Trafficking Task Forces	14
4.2.2 Attorney General’s Statewide Workgroup	15
4.2.3 Child Welfare Council Call to Action	15
4.2.4 Legislative Actions	17
4.3 Bay Area	17
4.3.1 Bay Area Anti-Trafficking Coalition (BAATC)	17
4.3.2 South Bay Coalition to End Human Trafficking (SBCEHT)	18
4.3.3 San Francisco Collaborative Against Human Trafficking (SFCAHT)	19
4.3.4 San Francisco Mayor’s Anti-Human Trafficking Task Force	20
4.3.5 Bay Area H.E.A.T. Coalition (BAHC)	20
4.3.6 Alameda County Human Exploitation and Trafficking Watch (H.E.A.T. Watch)	21
4.3.7 San Mateo County	22
<b>5 Strategies In Action: Impacts and Gaps</b>	<b>23</b>
5.1 Government at Work	24
5.1.1 Social Services	24
5.1.2 Protocols	24
5.1.3 Arrests	24

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

5.1.4	<i>Alameda County</i> .....	25
5.2	Collaboration.....	26
5.3	Reducing Demand.....	26
5.3.1	<i>Catch and Punish</i> .....	26
5.3.2	<i>Criminalizing Buying Sex</i> .....	27
5.3.3	<i>Anti-Demand Interventions</i> .....	27
5.3.4	<i>Technology-based Interventions</i> .....	27
5.4	Prevention.....	28
5.4.1	<i>Public Awareness</i> .....	28
5.4.2	<i>Prevention Education</i> .....	29
5.4.3	<i>Training Professionals</i> .....	29
5.5	Victim Services.....	30
5.5.1	<i>Crisis Response</i> .....	30
5.5.2	<i>Shelter, Group Homes, and Housing</i> .....	30
5.5.3	<i>Case Management, Therapy, Mentoring and Drop-In Centers</i> .....	31
5.5.4	<i>Legal Services</i> .....	31
<b>6</b>	<b>Landscape of Services</b> .....	<b>32</b>
6.1	Charts .....	33
<b>7</b>	<b>References</b> .....	<b>48</b>

# Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

## 1 Introduction

The Economic Development & Justice Giving Circle (EDJe) is a philanthropic group of activist donors that is part of Women's Foundation of California's Giving Circle Network. Each year EDJe members consider and select a focus for giving that has the potential to impact the well-being of low income women. In 2013 EDJe selected human trafficking as its focus, and in 2014 refined that focus to sex trafficking, asking what is being done in the Bay Area to combat sex trafficking, and what more could be done if EDJe's grantmaking dollars were leveraged to improve the economic security of women and girls who are lured or forced into being prostituted.

As a strategic grantmaking tactic, EDJe invested in a Landscape Analysis of commercial sexual exploitation (CSE) and the efforts to combat sex trafficking in the Bay Area. This paper includes current efforts and activities, pressing needs, gaps in resources, and potential points of leverage and will inform EDJe's future philanthropic investments.

The paper is divided into eight sections. Sections 2 and 3 provide background information and define some of the terminology of commercial sexual exploitation (CSE). There is an outline of the laws enacted to prevent, prosecute and punish perpetrators and exploiters; an overview of the victims of CSE; and how the business of selling people works.

Section 4 describes the federal, State and Bay Area task forces and coalitions that are working to define the scope of the problem and to generate solutions.

Section 5 explains distinct strategies including prevention, demand reduction, prosecution, victim assistance, training and collaboration, and their effectiveness.

In Section 6, Bay Area organizations are charted with names and contact information, and a summary of their CSE-related scope of work. Their CSE experience and the degree to which they focus on CSE is also described.

References to articles and papers are listed in Section 7.

As public awareness of CSE grows, the public response has been to demand greater efforts to combat all forms of human trafficking. The government must provide leadership in the fight against modern day slavery. Enforcement of current laws will continue to lead to the arrest and prosecution of human trafficking criminals – individuals and enterprises. The policy and networking activities of tasks forces and coalitions, and the important role of non-government agencies must continue.

With limited government sponsored safety net services, nonprofits must create systems and programs to prevent victimization and to support victims, especially children. Without these efforts, it will not be possible for countless victims to re-integrate into society and to lead normal lives.

I have made every effort to describe the status of efforts as of January 2015 as accurately as possible. I apologize for any errors.

## **Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area**

I wish to thank and commend the EDJe Giving Circle for its interest and engagement in combatting commercial sexual exploitation.

Amy Rassen  
Rassen and Associates  
[amy@rassenassociates.org](mailto:amy@rassenassociates.org)  
415-652-4533  
[www.rassenassociates.org](http://www.rassenassociates.org)  
January 2015

# Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

## 2 Background Information

Human trafficking is the modern day equivalent of slavery. It exists in virtually every country in the world, in every state in the United States and throughout the Bay Area. It's a very lucrative crime, bringing quick, high profits with few start-up costs. The business of human trafficking relies on strong demand. Current economic and social conditions create an abundant supply of victims. Exploiters meet the needs of their customers - businesses as well as individuals.

While accurate numbers are hard to come by because of the hidden nature of the crime, it is estimated that there are approximately 27 million victims worldwide, and, in the United States, an estimated two to three million adults and between 100,000 - 300,000 children.

After drug trafficking, human trafficking is the world's second most profitable criminal enterprise, a status it shares with illegal arms trafficking. While labor trafficking is a larger criminal enterprise than sex trafficking, they both take advantage of prevailing financial and social conditions, and make promises to their prey that will never be kept.

The United States is one of the top destination countries for trafficking in persons. California is one of the nation's top four destination states, with three of the FBI's 13 highest child sex trafficking areas in the nation: Los Angeles, San Francisco, and San Diego.<sup>1</sup> The Bay Area as a preferred location is second only to Los Angeles.

### 2.1 Who Is Trafficked and Where They Come From

As noted in the report from Attorney General Kamala Harris,<sup>2</sup> *The State of Human Trafficking in California: 2012*, trafficking is the world's fastest growing criminal enterprise generating an estimated \$32 billion-a-year globally. Although this paper focuses solely on domestic sex trafficking (commercial sexual exploitation), CSE victims can be found working as household servants, in sweatshops, on construction sites, in agricultural fields and in foreign countries as child soldiers.

Human trafficking is a local issue as well as a global problem. Victims are trafficked across international borders, as well as within a country, from city to city or even within a single neighborhood. Victims of trafficking in the United States are U.S. citizens or foreign nationals - documented and undocumented - adults, adolescents and children, women, men and transgendered individuals.

### 2.2 Types of Trafficking<sup>3</sup>

The international, national and California definitions of trafficking underscore the varied and widespread nature of human trafficking. Individuals may be trafficked for purposes

---

<sup>1</sup> [The Federal Bureau of Investigation's Efforts to Combat Crimes Against Children](#), Audit Report 09-08, January 2009.

<sup>2</sup> <http://oag.ca.gov/human-trafficking>

<sup>3</sup> United States Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report*, 2014. Available at [www.state.gov/documents/organization/226844.pdf](http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/226844.pdf).

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

of commercial sexual exploitation; for labor in industries such as agriculture, mining, textiles, fisheries, restaurants, factory work, and construction; for domestic servitude in private homes; and even for the provision of organs or other vital tissues. Bonded labor (for example, to pay off an artificially inflated “debt” for transportation, training, housing, sustenance, or even “uniforms”) and trafficking in the context of forced criminal activity (for example, transporting illegal drugs or weapons) are additional forms of human trafficking. Children can be trafficked into all of the industries described above. They may also be exploited as child soldiers, members of begging and peddling rings, “mail-order brides,” or as part of illegal adoption processes.

### 2.3 Human Trafficking Definitions

#### 2.3.1 Palermo Protocol

In 2000, the international community developed and agreed to a definition for trafficking in persons that can be found in Article 3 of the **United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children** as follows:

Trafficking in persons shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power, or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs (Europol, 2005, p. 10).

#### 2.3.2 United States Trafficking Victims Protection Act

At the same time, the U.S. Congress defined and classified human trafficking into two distinct categories—sex trafficking and labor trafficking—in the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 (TVPA).

**Sex Trafficking:** the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for the purpose of a commercial sex act, in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person forced to perform such an act is under the age of 18 years (22 USC § 7102; 8 CFR § 214.11(a))

**Labor Trafficking:** the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage or slavery (22 USC § 7102).

**Organ Trafficking:** a newly recognized emerging global health problem thought to occur throughout the world. The United Nations notes that “the organs

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

commonly transplanted include kidney, liver, heart, lung, and pancreas.”<sup>4</sup>  
Trafficking of corneas has also been reported in the lay press.

The Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000 (P.L. 106-386), the Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act of 2003 (H.R. 2620), the Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act of 2005 (H.R. 972), and the Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act of 2008 (H.R. 7311) also offer a framework for current and future U.S. anti-trafficking efforts. They address the prevention of trafficking, protection and assistance for victims of trafficking, and prosecution and punishment of traffickers. The 2005 reauthorization in particular highlighted the need to address the trafficking of U.S. citizens and permanent residents, especially minor victims of sex trafficking within U.S. borders (22 U.S.C §7103).<sup>5</sup> Tools were provided in the reauthorizations to combat trafficking in persons both worldwide and domestically.<sup>6</sup> Per the TVPA, victims do not need to be transported across international or other boundaries for trafficking to exist.

Under the U.S. definition, transportation or physical movement of the victim does not necessarily need to be present in order for the crime to occur; instead, it is the presence of exploitation (force, fraud, or coercion) that indicates whether a trafficking crime has occurred.

### 2.3.3 California

The California Legislature defined human trafficking as "all acts involved in the recruitment, abduction, transport, harboring, transfer, sale or receipt of persons, within national or across international borders, through force, coercion, fraud or deception, to place persons in situations of slavery or slavery-like conditions, forced labor or services, such as forced prostitution or sexual services, domestic servitude, bonded sweatshop labor, or other debt bondage."<sup>7</sup>

In 2005 California enacted its first anti-trafficking bill, which made trafficking a felony and provided assistance to victims. Human trafficking for forced labor or services is a felony in California.

As codified in the California Penal Code, anyone who "deprives or violates the personal liberty of another with the intent . . . to obtain forced labor or services" is guilty of human trafficking. Depriving or violating a person's liberty includes "substantial and sustained restriction of another's liberty accomplished through fraud, deceit, coercion, violence, duress, menace, or threat of unlawful injury to the victim or to another person, under circumstances where the person receiving or apprehending the threat reasonably believes that it is likely that the person making the threat would carry it out."

---

<sup>4</sup> United Nations Regional Information Centre for Western Europe. Organs for sale. [www.unric.org/en/human-trafficking/27447-organs-for-sale](http://www.unric.org/en/human-trafficking/27447-organs-for-sale).

<sup>5</sup> Human Trafficking Into and Within the United States: A Review of the Literature. Heather J. Clawson, Nicole Dutch, Amy Solomon, and Lisa Goldblatt Grace August 2009

<sup>6</sup> Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA)

<sup>7</sup> AB 22: California Trafficking Victims Protection Act (CTVPA) (2005)



## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

Forced labor or services include "labor or services that are performed or provided by a person and are obtained or maintained through force, fraud, or coercion, or equivalent conduct that would reasonably overbear the will of the person."

### 3 Business of Domestic Sex Trafficking

The low risk/high profit business of sex trafficking has three arms: exploiters/business owners, customers/purchasers and product/human victims. Exploiters running big businesses use recruiters to identify "people goods", the potential victims for the traffickers. They may know the victims as acquaintances, family members or friends. Or they may be strangers. Many come from the same country or cultural background as their victims. Familiarity allows recruiters to more easily exploit the vulnerabilities of their targets. They promise a better life even as they employ combinations of persuasion, intimidation or violence to kidnap and control the victims.

Demand is at the root of the trafficking business. The demand for commercial sex creates the market force that sustains CSE.

#### 3.1 Traffickers

Exploiters – traffickers and pimps - operate individually, in gangs<sup>8</sup> or as companies.

Traffickers<sup>9</sup> are male or female, foreign nationals or U.S. citizens, members of organized crime networks, or individual operators. While some traffickers may be complete strangers, many are known to — and trusted by — the victim as well as her/his family. Female traffickers may be known and respected in the victim's community, where they gain access with inflated or distorted offers of employment or education to unsuspecting victims and their families. Male traffickers may lure at-risk individuals by using a "boyfriend" approach in which seduction is the key tactic; a "daddy" approach in which the trafficker shows kindness to the individual and provides emotional affirmation, financial assistance and/or material goods; or a combination of these scenarios. Children may be abducted and sold into the commercial sex trade by their families.<sup>10</sup> Thus, traffickers can be:

- Friends or acquaintances
- Family members
- Spouses/partners
- Neighbors
- Community members

---

<sup>8</sup> Domestic gangs operate businesses, are sophisticated and very organized. For example, domestic street gangs set aside traditional rivalries to set up commercial sex rings and maximize profits from the sale of young women. Attorney General Kamala Harris, The State of Human Trafficking in California: 2012 <http://oag.ca.gov/human-trafficking>

<sup>9</sup> [http://www.massmed.org/Patient-Care/Health-Topics/Violence-Prevention-and-Intervention/Human-Trafficking-\(pdf\)](http://www.massmed.org/Patient-Care/Health-Topics/Violence-Prevention-and-Intervention/Human-Trafficking-(pdf))

<sup>10</sup> Guidebook to Human Trafficking for Healthcare Providers. Massachusetts Medical Society and the Massachusetts General Hospital. 2014

## **Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area**

- Religious leaders
- Recruiters from varying types of employment agencies
- Owners and managers of businesses and factories – large and small
- Brokers for temporary workers – in offices, in the fields or factories

Recruitment of both victims and customers may take place in person, or online, via the Internet and social media.

According to the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children, a pimp can make \$150,000-\$200,000 per child each year and the average pimp has four to six girls in his stable.

### **3.2 Customers**

Customers – “johns” - are mostly men; neighbors, friends, and family members. A study by ProCon.org estimated that 15% to 20% of men in the US paid for sex at least once in their lifetimes.<sup>11</sup> Most surveys find between 10% and 20% of men admit to the crime of purchasing sex at some point in their lives.<sup>12</sup>

### **3.3 Victims**

#### **3.3.1 Legal Status**

Prostitution is a crime in California. Legally, prostitution is engaging in a sexual act in exchange for money or other consideration such as other goods or services. California prostitution law under Penal Code 647(b) PC prohibits engaging in the act of prostitution, and offering (this is also known as "solicitation") or agreeing to engage in the act of prostitution.<sup>13</sup>

Women and men participating in sex in exchange for money are arrested for committing the crime of prostitution. However, in the Bay Area in particular, it is understood by law enforcement that most of those arrested are not acting of their own free will, but rather are being forced by a third party who takes most of the money the customer pays the prostitute. As a result, adult prostitutes are viewed as victims, and provided services as needed and available. [Note: Women and men who define their job as a Sex Worker say they are choosing their profession and do not consider themselves victims.]

However, by law, youth in California are considered victims. Previously treated as criminals and funneled into the juvenile justice system, victim status allows the youth access to services and, in some cases, financial assistance.

#### **3.3.2 Characteristics**

Most studies find the average age of entry into victimization to be between 12 and 14. In the Bay Area, commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) focused agencies usually first see victims when they are 15 or 16, three or four years into their exploitation.

---

<sup>11</sup> [http://prostitution.procon.org/view\\_resource.php?resourceID=004119](http://prostitution.procon.org/view_resource.php?resourceID=004119)

<sup>12</sup> Shively, Michael, et al. A National Overview of Prostitution and Sex Trafficking Demand Reduction Efforts, Final Report. US Department of Justice. June 2012

<sup>13</sup> [http://www.shouselaw.com/engaging\\_in\\_prostitution.html](http://www.shouselaw.com/engaging_in_prostitution.html)

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

Most victims, but not all, are female, with a range of backgrounds in terms of age, nationality, socioeconomic status, and education. While backgrounds vary, one characteristic is common to all: vulnerability - for social, financial or psychological reasons.

Minor victims are often underage runaways. They frequently come from backgrounds of sexual and physical abuse, incest, poverty, and/or addiction, often with prior or current involvement in the child welfare system. In fact, numerous studies indicate that 50% to 80% of child victims of CSE are or were formerly involved in the child welfare system. These factors and others, such as limited education, lack of employment, and exposure to community violence, “push” young people into getting exploited. Pull factors – why exploiters succeed in luring them into “the life” – focus on misplaced trust in others; being seduced by a “boyfriend”; believing promises of a storybook future; and media driven fantasies and desires.

Run-away youth<sup>14</sup> are approached by an exploiter or a sexual predator within 48 hours of being on the street. They trade sex for survival – food, shelter and clothing. Their traumatic childhood experiences of multiple forms of abuse get repeated as they cycle through the stages of exploitation to deal with their exploiters’ manipulation, being homeless and/or having no money.

### 3.3.3 Work

Child victims of sex trafficking can become involved in a variety of enterprises: street prostitution, brothel-based work, internet-based prostitution, and pornography. The “work” of adult victims is similar, but also includes coerced employment in sexualized jobs as hostesses, exotic dancers, strippers, escorts, massage parlor workers, and as “companions” at truck stops.<sup>15</sup>

### 3.3.4 Numbers

Sex trafficking is an “invisible” crime, so the actual numbers of victims remains unknown. The US Department of Justice estimates that two to three million adults and 100,000 to 300,000 children are trafficked for sex in the United States annually.

Local estimates of CSE youth victims range from 100 to 300 individuals per Bay Area County at any point in time. This data is based on the number of children in the court system and/or receiving help from a CSE focused service agency.

The data below is taken from recent reports about girls and women “in the life”:

- Santa Clara County: 114 youth ages 12 to 18 were identified as victims of sex trafficking in the Santa Clara County Study prepared by Transitions Global.<sup>16</sup>

---

<sup>14</sup> Runaway youth – boys and girls – are forced to engage in “survival sex” – trading sex for food, shelter safety or drugs.

<sup>15</sup> Polaris Project. Sex trafficking in the U.S. 2014. Available at [www.polarisproject.org/human-trafficking/sex-trafficking-in-the-us](http://www.polarisproject.org/human-trafficking/sex-trafficking-in-the-us).

<sup>16</sup> Anti-Human Trafficking Study. [www.gatewaycommunityoutreach.org](http://www.gatewaycommunityoutreach.org)

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

- Alameda County: In 2013, Bay Area Women Against Rape served 228 children involved in sexual exploitation.<sup>17</sup> Also in Alameda County, the Oakland Police Department arrested 442 women, 83 “johns”, 12 pimps, and 30 juveniles in 2013. MISSEY and WestCoast Counseling Clinic, both located in Oakland, also served 100 girls each under age 18. [Note: Some of the aforementioned numbers may be duplicative.]
- San Francisco: According to Huckleberry Youth, 50 to 75 homeless 18-24 year olds exchanged sex for drugs/food/shelter in 2013 and 124 girls were provided services related to sex trafficking. Additionally, 45 youth were identified as trafficked while in foster care.
- Contra Costa County: The Family Justice Center in Richmond said it helped 30 victims of sex trafficking each year since the facility's 2011 opening. About half of those victims were under 18, and many were already sexually abused before being exploited by a pimp. Community Violence Solutions, an organization that oversees the Rape Crisis Center of Contra Costa and Marin Counties, served 67 sexually exploited youth at its drop-in center in one year.
- According to the San Francisco Crime Spotting website <http://sanfrancisco.crimespotting.org/crimes/Prostitution>, 20 reports between Monday, Jul 28, 2014 through Friday, Oct 24, 2014 reflected 4,835 reports of prostitution. [Note: This has not been confirmed by the San Francisco Police Department.]<sup>18</sup>

### 3.3.5 Child Victim Examples

From a January 28, 2014 article in the New York Times by Patricia Leigh Brown, *A Court's All-Hands Approach Aids Girls Most* ,:

- Sixteen year old Toni J., lives with 11 family members in West Oakland, on a street buffeted by gang activity and poverty. Her mother died of an overdose, her father in a revenge shooting. In ninth grade, she was raped while on probation for shoplifting.
- A second girl, who was in detention in juvenile hall, entered the courtroom through a guarded, Brinks-like door. The police had found her passed out on an Oakland street, having injected drugs she could not identify.
- A third young woman, the daughter of a methamphetamine addict, was “sold” by her mother to an uncle in the Central Valley who sexually exploited her in exchange for drugs.
- A 17-year-old has been sexually abused since childhood, one of her molesters an older brother. Last year, she fled a group home and became homeless, at one point sleeping in a park.

---

<sup>17</sup> <http://www.fbi.gov/sanfrancisco/press-releases/2014/bay-area-women-against-rape-selected-as-san-francisco-recipient-of-the-2013-directors-community-leadership-award>

<sup>18</sup> <http://sanfrancisco.crimespotting.org/crimes/Prostitution> -

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

### 3.4 Scope of Illegal Activity

According to the report produced by Michael Shively in 2012 for the Justice Department, while most men in the United States do not illegally buy sex, it is not universally condemned. At least one out of six men buy sex. A larger portion of men say they believe buying sex harms no one and is not wrong. The same report notes that a study of teenagers in grades 7 through 12 found nearly four percent to have exchanged sex for drugs or money, which extrapolates to 650,000 teenagers who say they have engaged in commercial sex.

### 3.5 How It Works

The sex industry is comprised of many sectors: street prostitution, strip clubs, residential brothels, pornography stores and massage parlors, to name a few. Customers/"johns" may find what they are looking for the old fashioned way, by going to a specific location. Increasingly common is the use of social media and other online tools that connect buyers with sellers

Traffickers' methods are tailored to take advantage of the victims' individual and cultural characteristics, to exert power and maintain control over her. Tactics include but are not limited to:

- Moving victims from place to place
- Confiscating personal possessions
- Seizing money made from tricks
- Physical violence: forcing victims to take drugs, beating them, raping them
- Intimidation: wielding weapons
- Coercion and threats of violence against family members, blackmail, and extortion
- Constant surveillance

Combined, these tactics keep the victims isolated and ensure that they remain under the control of traffickers or their associates. Physical and emotional violence is fundamental to this industry. With no identification or money, fear of possible deportation or reprisals on their families, if a victim should become free she is likely to have no place to go.

In summary, the victims, mostly female, work against their will and live in fear. Their traffickers/pimps control them to keep them working. Some - especially minors - for complex psychological reasons, believe their pimps love them – even as they are lied to, beaten, and held captive.

## 4 Governmental Response

### 4.1 Federal

**A Presidential Interagency Task Force To Monitor and Combat Human Trafficking** is a cabinet-level entity created by the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 (TVPA). The Task Force consists of 14 departments and agencies from the federal government that are responsible for coordinating U.S. government efforts to combat

## **Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area**

trafficking in persons. The Task Force meets annually and is chaired by the Secretary of State. It has four areas that drive interagency collaboration: victim services, rule of law, procurement and supply chains, and public awareness and outreach.

Building on the work of the President's Interagency Task Force to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons, a **Federal Strategic Action Plan on Services for Victims of Human Trafficking in the United States** was developed in 2013 to ensure that all victims of human trafficking in the United States have access to the tools and services they need to escape exploitation and rebuild their lives.

The plan lays out four goals related to victim services for 2013 to 2017 along with associated action items for improvements to victim service, as follows:

1. Increase coordination and collaboration at the federal, regional, state, tribal and local levels
2. Increase awareness of human trafficking among government and community leaders and the general public
3. Expand access to services for victims of human trafficking
4. Improve outcomes related to health, safety, and well-being

The federal government makes funds available to qualified organizations through a request for proposal process (RFP) to carry out selected action items in the Strategic Plan and in order to achieve the above goals.

### **4.2 California**

#### **4.2.1 Regional Anti-Human Trafficking Task Forces<sup>19</sup>**

In 2004 and 2005, the U.S. Department of Justice awarded grants to create six regional task forces in California to combat human trafficking. In 2009 and 2010, the California Emergency Management Agency used American Recovery and Reinvestment Act grant funds to supplement the original six task forces and establish three new regional task forces.

These regional anti-human trafficking task forces are made up of law enforcement and local, state, and federal prosecutors, as well as other governmental leaders and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs). Their focus is on law enforcement and their approach is victim-centered.

According to a judge in San Mateo County, the Regional Task Forces situated in the Bay Area are coordinated to some extent by the U.S. Attorney's Office in San Francisco. A U.S. Attorney (AUSA) holds Executive Meetings of the Task Force once or twice a year. In attendance are all the local, state, and federal law enforcement agencies working on human trafficking investigations. One AUSA is designated the human trafficking point of contact for criminal investigations within the office, and another AUSA coordinates the Task Force meetings.

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

From mid-2010 to mid-2012, California's nine regional human trafficking task forces identified 1,277 victims of human trafficking, initiated 2,552 investigations, and arrested 1,798 individuals. As part of their work to combat human trafficking, the task forces also provide training to a variety of audiences on how to identify and respond to the crime. In the same two-year period, California's task forces provided training to 25,591 law enforcement personnel, prosecutors, victim service providers, and other first responders.

### 4.2.2 Attorney General's Statewide Workgroup

California Attorney General Kamala Harris, first convened leaders from the State's law enforcement and victim advocacy communities in 2007 as the **California Alliance to Combat Trafficking and Slavery Task Force**. In 2012 the group was reconvened and added to its membership service providers, technology companies and academic institutions. Their purpose was to evaluate the nature and extent of human trafficking in California; for government and non-governmental organizations to use their expertise and viewpoints to discuss the current landscape of human trafficking in California; and to evaluate and propose innovative strategies to investigate and prosecute traffickers and to assist victims.

The 2012 paper, *The State of Human Trafficking in California*, studied and then made recommendations for action in the following four areas:

1. Identifying the Scope of Human Trafficking in California
2. Holding Traffickers Accountable: Law Enforcement Investigations and Prosecutions
3. Victim-Centered Approach: Protecting and Assisting Victims of Human Trafficking
4. Prevention and Public Education: Reducing Demand for Human Trafficking

It should be noted that work group members collaborated further with each other. These efforts have resulted in improved technology for law enforcement, use of the Internet to track and apprehend exploiters, and improved data collection statewide.

### 4.2.3 Child Welfare Council Call to Action

Six years ago, the California Legislature created the Child Welfare Council to serve as an advisory body to the Legislature to improve the collaboration and processes of the multiple agencies, programs and courts that serve children and youth in California's child welfare and foster care systems.

*Ending Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children: A Call for Multi System Collaboration in California* was written by the Child Welfare Council's CSEC Workgroup<sup>20</sup> in 2013 in recognition of the need for the child welfare system to deal with

---

<sup>20</sup> The Workgroup consisted of youth survivors and foster parents, and public and private agency representatives from social services, mental health, probation, law enforcement, courts and child advocacy groups.

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

studies revealing an estimated 50% to 80% of victims of commercial sexual exploitation (CSE) who are or were formerly involved in the child welfare system.

The Council recognized that CSE children are likely to become involved with or be clients of law enforcement, probation, education, mental health, medical and public health systems as well as nonprofit organizations. Though all currently serve these victims, the report noted that service is often provided in ways that are not coordinated nor philosophically aligned.

The Council therefore recommended the following changes and improvements to existing systems, services and approaches within the child welfare system:

1. **Placement:** Establish safe and secure emergency and transitional placements for CSEC victims.
2. **Identification:** Implement cross-system screening tools to systematically identify CSEC and children at-risk of exploitation in order to inform and improve service delivery and placement decisions.
3. **Training:** Mandate training for all professionals working with youth in child-serving systems, including, but not limited to, the child welfare, juvenile justice, probation, mental health and education, to better identify CSEC and children at-risk, provide CSEC specialized services and supports, and use culturally competent and trauma-informed practices.
4. **Data:** Develop protocols and strategies to coordinate, collect and share data across systems to better understand the scope of the problem, the level of interaction with multiple systems, and CSEC specific needs.

The report emphasized in its recommendations that intervention and prevention measures needed to be undertaken simultaneously in order to both provide victimized children with both a caring family and with services to heal from trauma.

In order to effectively implement the above recommendations, “the Workgroup recommended that a CSEC Action Committee be created to plan, develop, and oversee action steps needed to improve California’s response to the growing number of children being sold for sex each night, that it be co-convened by the Secretary of the California Health and Human Services Agency and a community-based advocacy organization representative and charged with facilitating a collaborative and comprehensive process for prioritizing, sequencing, and overseeing implementation of the recommendations adopted by the Council. Committee membership should include leaders representing state and local government agencies, CSEC service providers, youth advocates, court representatives, and CSEC survivors.”<sup>21</sup>

---

<sup>21</sup> Ending Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children: A Call for Multi System Collaboration in California, Child Welfare Council, 2013, page 3



## **Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area**

### **4.2.4 Legislative Actions<sup>22</sup>**

In 2014 the Legislature amended the Welfare and Institutions Code WIC (commencing with section 16524.6) to establish a \$5 million state-funded county CSEC Program to be administered by the California Department of Social Services (CDSS). Counties may opt in to participate in the following opportunities:

1. CDSS will spend \$1.75 million to provide statewide training for county child workers and out-of-home caregivers that cover awareness and identification of children who are commercially sexually exploited, or who are at-risk of being commercially sexually exploited. Trainings are to be made available throughout the state and be provided by a variety of contractors, such as the Regional Training Academies and community colleges.
2. CDSS will spend \$750,000 for the training of foster youth to help them recognize and avoid commercial sexual exploitation. The statute permits counties to target training to foster youth who are at-risk of commercial sexual exploitation. The funding will be allocated to counties who elect to participate in the CSEC Program.
3. The remaining \$2.5 million for FY 2014-15 will be allocated to participating counties for protocol development and capacity building for services to commercially sexually exploited children. Activities include local and interagency protocols, CSEC program implementation and training or services related to victims of commercial sexual exploitation.

### **4.3 Bay Area**

The Bay Area has several coalitions and task forces, in addition to the three that are part of the state's Regional Anti-Human Trafficking Forces noted in section 4.2.1 (North Bay, South Bay, and East Bay). While the Regional Task Forces focus mainly on work related to and addressing the crime of human trafficking, by and large the missions of county task forces address collaboration, education, public awareness, outreach, advocacy, and supporting survivors of human trafficking. Their specific activities include networking and sharing information through regular meetings; advocating for funding to support the work of its members; coordinating and tracking local efforts; and collecting data on human trafficking efforts, victims and service needs.

Each is staffed by one or two people. Funding for two or three task forces originates and continues from local government, and is then expanded for some to include grant support and individual donations. Others receive no government funding.

#### **4.3.1 Bay Area Anti-Trafficking Coalition (BAATC)**

Bay Area Anti-Trafficking Coalition promotes “efforts [to] equip and engage individuals, civic groups, and non-profits with best practices to sustain in the fight against human trafficking in the San Francisco Bay Area and beyond. We work to build collaboration

---

<sup>22</sup> September 3, 2014 Letter to all counties from Greg Rose, Deputy Director, Children and Family Services Division, CA Department of Social Services RE: Commercially Sexually Exploited Children (CSEC) Program

## **Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area**

between local non-profits to establish a stronger continuum of care among victim service providers, and educate activists about how to sustain in their continuum of engagement to intervene on behalf of those who are enslaved.”<sup>23</sup>

Established in 2011 as an outgrowth of the Freedom Summit, a gathering of 1700 attendees and 33 anti-human trafficking organizations, the Coalition describes itself as “backbone and connective tissue helping individuals, churches and anti-trafficking organizations work effectively together to build a unified San Francisco Bay Area response to human trafficking.”<sup>24</sup> This is accomplished by partnering with community members, government and non-government agencies and other coalitions/task forces. Formal membership is not required to participate in the BAATC.

BAATC hosted the 2013 Freedom Summit and is planning the next Freedom Summit for 2015. In addition to participating on all the other Bay Area Task Forces and Coalitions, BAATC regularly hosts gatherings of anti-human trafficking organizations and provides training for airport and airline personnel. The latter are in unique positions to stop trafficking in transit at the San Jose and Oakland Airports.

BAATC plans to create a one-stop web resource, across counties, to map all human trafficking efforts and work in the Bay Area, as well as a database of individuals and organizations who provide training about human trafficking.

### **4.3.2 South Bay Coalition to End Human Trafficking (SBCEHT)**

The South Bay Coalition to End Human Trafficking (SBCEHT) held its first meeting in February 2005 to establish a multidisciplinary response to human trafficking in the South Bay Area. Its mission is to ensure the protection of victims, the prosecution of offenders, and the prevention of human trafficking and slavery through an effective coordinated partnership.<sup>25</sup>

SBCEHT is a free standing organization with approximately 35 members, not attached to an agency or a government department, with four standing committees, each of which operates independently but under the direction of an Executive Committee: Law Enforcement (SJPD Human Trafficking Task Force); Victim Services; Outreach and Education; and Legal Services. The Coalition effectuates its mission through a victim-centered, trauma-informed approach.

SBCEHT recognizes that at major sports events bring a lot of attention to the issue of trafficking. In preparation for the 2016 Super Bowl being held at Levi Stadium in Santa Clara County, SBCEHT took the initiative to implement a study to see how other cities prepared for and responded to this increase of attention. In addition, they evaluated the data available that attempts to examine whether a relationship in fact exists between sporting events and trafficking, and whether any data explores labor trafficking. They

---

<sup>23</sup> [www.baaatc.org](http://www.baaatc.org)

<sup>24</sup> Ibid

<sup>25</sup> <http://www.southbayendtrafficking.org>

## **Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area**

used the lessons learned from the case studies to inform a cross-county Super Bowl 2016 Workgroup in developing the group's guidelines and overall structure.

Collaboration across all the Bay Area counties has expanded through SBCEHT's Super Bowl Workgroup. Three subgroups have been established to increase public awareness of the problem of human trafficking and reduce the demand for sex trafficking:

- Law Enforcement/ Govt. Agencies: Focusing on up-to-date protocols, and cross county collaboration.
- Direct Service Agencies: Focusing on assessing existing resources in the Bay Area for trafficking survivors, and a community resource guide.
- Community Outreach: Focusing on awareness raising/training of businesses, public outreach, and direct outreach to at-risk populations.

Other points about Santa Clara County efforts:

- Santa Clara County recently initiated a Human Trafficking Commission, co-chaired by the County's District Attorney, the Sheriff's Department and a member of the Board of Supervisors. The Coalition holds two seats out of 17.
- The County responds to crisis calls on a 24/7 basis. Victims are connected to law enforcement, social services and legal services.
- The County recently approved a CSEC protocol.
- Initially part of the Coalition, a workgroup led by Juvenile Probation focuses exclusively on CSEC issues, such as direct services and law enforcement protocols when minors are apprehended.

### **4.3.3 San Francisco Collaborative Against Human Trafficking (SFC AHT)**

Like BAATC and SBCEHT, the SFC AHT is a local initiative, but addresses human trafficking throughout the Bay Area. Its main areas of focus include: education (public awareness), outreach, advocacy for comprehensive victim-centered policies, and supporting survivors of human trafficking. Activities center on increasing public awareness of human trafficking and its many impacts; enhancing and improving responses to human trafficking; supporting service providers who work with victims; and monitoring local, state and national legislation that is anti-trafficking focused.

The SFC AHT is a private-public coalition with membership open to government agencies, non-profit organizations and community members involved in the Bay Area effort to eradicate human trafficking. Currently there are 30 members. The SFC AHT's mission is to ensure an organized, multidisciplinary and multiagency response to human trafficking by providing a broad mechanism for collaboration, inclusive of:

- Federal, state and city law enforcement agencies
- Government and non-profit service providers
- Advocacy groups
- Policy and law makers
- Educators

## **Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area**

- Bay Area interfaith community members

Bylaws govern the structure and work of SFC AHT. Standing and ad hoc committees develop and implement programs; develop recommendations on policies and practices in the field; provide legislative updates to the Collaborative; determine actions to take to implement new anti-trafficking laws; and advance advocacy efforts to support pending anti-trafficking legislation.

In addition to regular membership and standing committee meetings and hosting networking gatherings, recent activities include sponsorship of the conference, “Exploring the Hidden Epidemic of Labor Trafficking”, an annual Human Trafficking Awareness Month, and an annual Anti-Trafficking Teen Poster Contest.

Since May 2014, the National Council of Jewish Women has staffed the Collaborative. SFC AHT’s operations are funded by its member-organizations.

### **4.3.4 San Francisco Mayor’s Anti-Human Trafficking Task Force**

Created in 2012, the Mayor’s Task Force is a government entity, initiated by the Mayor’s Office to improve the city’s policies and protocols to combat human trafficking. The Task Force is governed by the Mayor’s Office and City regulations, and is staffed by the San Francisco Department on the Status of Women. The focus is on systems change/policy.

Examples of their activities include the following:

- Creation of a data collection tool
- Identification of a gap in services for CSEC along with efforts to get it funded
- Discussions of best practices in responding to CSEC
- Spearheading the creation and distribution of the trafficking posters required by state law
- Establishing a Sex Worker and Trafficking Committee

The Task Force’s Sex Worker and Trafficking Committee has resulted in expansion of a “bad date” line for sex workers to anonymously report violent predators (including traffickers) to other sex workers and possibly to police; and exploring an immunity policy with the District Attorney for sex workers who report violence.

### **4.3.5 Bay Area H.E.A.T. Coalition (BAHC)<sup>26</sup>**

Bay Area H.E.A.T. Coalition (BAHC) was established by Alameda County District Attorney Nancy O’Malley to increase communication, cooperation, and collaboration between local, state, and federal law enforcement, service providers, systems, community members, and existing human trafficking task forces in the 9 Bay Area Counties with special emphasis on Alameda, San Francisco, and Contra Costa counties. BAHC’s main purpose is to:

---

<sup>26</sup> [www.heat-watch.org/heat\\_watch/what\\_we\\_do/bahc](http://www.heat-watch.org/heat_watch/what_we_do/bahc)

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

- Enhance local efforts to increase victim identification and recovery as well as effective investigation and prosecution of local and multi-jurisdictional trafficking cases
- Support and coordinate existing and emerging local service provider networks to fully function at the regional level
- Coordinate existing task forces and local law enforcement efforts to proactively function at a regional level
- Create and support regional capacity to identify trafficking trends and patterns throughout the Bay Area.

### 4.3.6 Alameda County Human Exploitation and Trafficking Watch (H.E.A.T. Watch)<sup>27</sup>

In 2002 the City of Oakland was identified as a hub for the commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) in the form of street prostitution and child pornography. Alameda County responded by launching the Sexually Exploited Minors Task Force, a year-long convening that brought together county, city and community leaders and representatives to begin examining the breadth and scope of sexual exploitation of children in the area.

In 2005 the countywide Sexually Exploited Minors (SEM) Network was formed, committed to establishing a continuum of CSEC specific services and system responses focused on addressing the complex needs of children and teens victimized through sexual exploitation.

One outgrowth of the SEM Network was the creation of protocols in identifying and handling CSEC victims. A second was the birth of H.E.A.T. Watch, under the direction of D.A. O'Malley. H.E.A.T. Watch's mission is "to be an effective regional response to human trafficking of all forms; to provide tools, education, and community engagement to change societal, legal, and institutional approaches; and to support victims and hold their offenders accountable."

The work of H.E.A.T. Watch is done in collaboration with Alameda County community-based organizations and other government agencies. Activities are wide-ranging:

- H.E.A.T. Watch makes certain that the public knows that human trafficking is illegal and where victims and bystanders can call for help.
- H.E.A.T. Watch routinely tracks arrests, prosecutions and the status of victims.
- In partnership with MISSEY and Clear Channel, H.E.A.T. Watch sponsored an awareness building billboard campaign.<sup>28</sup>
- Under the auspices of H.E.A.T. Watch, representatives of ten agencies meet weekly as a multi-disciplinary team (MDT) to identify, create safety plans and

---

<sup>27</sup> <http://www.heat-watch.org>

<sup>28</sup> See Section 5.4.1 on Public Awareness for details.

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

refer for services at-risk and high-risk youth victims of commercial sexual exploitation.<sup>29</sup>

- A H.E.A.T. Watch Radio show invites experts to talk about issues within the human trafficking field and produces podcasts, educational outreach materials.

Of note, because Oakland is a hub for human trafficking in California, the Mayor's Office<sup>30</sup> and the City Council are also deeply involved in anti-human trafficking efforts, funding violence prevention programming, organizing "take back the street" marches, and more. Calls for help are responded to on a 24/7 basis by law enforcement and BAWAR (Bay Area Women Against Rape).

In addition, in the City of Oakland there are least two CSEC Task Forces:

- A new city-wide network for stakeholders focused on raising awareness and cross collaboration has met on and off for a year and is currently trying to find its footing, but has been very useful in building a local anti-human trafficking movement;
- The Oakland Unified School District (OUSD) Task Force focused on prevention programming and referrals to services for CSEC involved youth or those at-risk for being exploited.

### 4.3.7 San Mateo County

No one coalition or task force oversees Human Trafficking efforts in San Mateo County.

The county's focus on CSEC began in 2011 with the establishment of the Blue Ribbon Commission on Foster Care Youth whose charge was to improve outcomes for youth in foster care. A Human Trafficking Subcommittee was formed a few months after, comprised of court stakeholders and community organizations. Dialogue focused improving outcomes for youth in foster care who were also CSEC or at-risk for CSEC, improving collaboration between stakeholders, and carving out intra-agency protocols concerning CSEC.

Other anti-human trafficking activities in San Mateo County include:

- The County's Children and Family Services division also oversees a CSEC Task Force, with representatives from Behavioral Health and Recovery Services and other service agencies.
- Federal law enforcement agencies have their own internal Human Trafficking Units, such as the FBI and Homeland Security. Both work closely with San Mateo County's local law enforcement personnel on criminal investigations involving

---

<sup>29</sup> Alameda County District Attorney's Office, Alameda County Public Defender's Office, Alameda County Probation Department, Alameda County Social Services Agency, BAWAR (Bay Area Women Against Rape), CALICO (The Child Abuse Listening, Interviewing and Coordination Center), Highland Hospital, JPG Consultants, MISSEY (Motivating, Inspiring, Supporting and Serving Sexually Exploited Youth), WCC (WestCoast Children's Clinic)

<sup>30</sup> The Mayor's Office has been involved in the CSEC effort since 2003 and funded the first CSEC direct services and advocacy in 2006 (Citizen's Initiative Measure Y.)

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

- human trafficking.
- Recently, the Anti-Trafficking Faith Leadership Coalition of San Mateo County (ATFLC) was formed to raise awareness of the issue within congregations in the County.
  - The Women's Section of the San Mateo County Bar Association will be designating 2015 as a year to raise awareness of the issue within the local bar association and in the community.

A human trafficking law enforcement protocol exists that addresses both adults and minors.<sup>31</sup>

### 5 Strategies In Action: Impacts and Gaps

The general public is, to a large extent, ignorant of the scale of human trafficking and the desolation of its victims. The belief that human trafficking isn't a problem – and certainly not in the U.S. or in “my” neighborhood – is predominant. This lack of awareness is a major impediment to institutional and individual commitment of resources to combat commercial sex.

Strategies to combat human trafficking fall into three broad categories: prevention, protection and prosecution.<sup>32</sup>

Prevention efforts focus on eliminating or reducing demand. The approach to prevention has been on creating and enforcing anti-human trafficking laws, educating the public, and training professionals to identify perpetrators. Prevention also includes educating vulnerable children and youth in how to avoid the seduction and false promises of pimps.

Protecting victims begins with identification, followed by service implementation. For victims of sex trafficking, the key steps are rescue, rehabilitation, and reintegration. Rehabilitation of victims includes access to resources, such as care coordination, housing, financial assistance, job readiness programs/employment, therapy and legal services. Because trauma underlines the life experience of all victims, a trauma-informed<sup>33</sup> approach must be used in all contacts with victims and care provided.

---

<sup>31</sup> San Mateo County Human Trafficking Protocol 2013

<sup>32</sup> <http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/fs/2012/194722.html>

<sup>33</sup> According to Harris and Falot (2001), providers often need to make fundamental changes in their attitudes, beliefs, and practices related to understanding trauma and its impact in order to be more successful in meeting the needs of their clients. The following concepts are key to making services trauma-informed and more effective:

- 1 *Understanding trauma is a defining and core life event* with a complex course that can shape a survivor's sense of self and others, rather than a discrete event with predictable and immediate impact.
- 2 *Understanding the consumer/survivor's complaints and symptoms are coping mechanisms* and original sources of strength within a relational approach to solutions that may no longer be effective, rather than viewing them as problems within an individualized view of the solutions.
- 3 *Understanding the primary goals of services are empowerment and recovery* (growth, mastery, and efficacy) which are prevention-driven, limited by survivor self-assessment and recovery needs, and requiring both the consumer and provider to assume shared risks, rather than the primary

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

Prosecution is an indispensable element for law enforcement to fight trafficking. The goal of prosecution is to catch the perpetrators and then match prison sentences to the crime committed.

### 5.1 Government at Work

#### 5.1.1 Social Services

Because studies have shown that a minimum of 50% to 80% of foster care children are or have been trafficked for sex, county governments, both law enforcement and social services, have initiated systemic interventions to mitigate the victimization of “system” children. The Department of Social Services is investing \$2.5 million throughout California in participating counties for protocol development and capacity building for services to commercially sexually exploited children. \$1.75 million has been allocated to train child welfare workers in awareness and identification of children who are commercially sexually exploited, or who are at-risk of being commercially sexually exploited.

However, the work of child welfare staff to better identify at-risk and CSE children and youth is in its infancy. Results such as significantly reducing the numbers of children becoming exploited by predators, will be seen in the future.

#### 5.1.2 Protocols

San Francisco, San Mateo, Santa Clara and Alameda Counties have unofficial protocols that take the identified victim from apprehension by law enforcement through crisis intervention by first responders to referral for shelter, social, medical and legal services, to the victim’s agreeing to work with a case manager. The case manager makes a safety plan with the victim. As trust and a relationship develops, the case manager and the victim discuss a hoped for future. Together they create and then work on carrying out the goals.

However, official, written protocols linking law enforcement activities to service interventions exist in only a few counties. Protocols are a first step. Effective implementation will need to follow.

#### 5.1.3 Arrests

A sampling of police action arrests in the Fall of 2014 includes:

- Four suspects have been arrested for allegedly operating a sex trafficking ring out of a massage parlor in Emeryville, California Attorney General Kamala Harris

- 
- goals being stability and absence of symptoms, a crisis orientation, time-limited by economic and administrative needs, and oriented to minimizing provider liability.
- 4 *Understanding the service relationship is collaborative*, with the survivor and provider having equally valuable knowledge, rather than viewing it as hierarchical with the provider having superior knowledge. This equal relationship ensures survivors are active planners and participants in ensuring their safety and developing services. This approach places a priority on choice and control and trust developed over time, rather than treating the survivor as a passive recipient where safety and trust are assumed from the outset.



## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

announced on Friday. 12/12/2014

- A woman from the Sacramento suburb of Rocklin accused of helping run a website that advertised prostitution services in MyRedBook pleaded guilty Thursday, according to court documents. 11/21/2014
- More than a dozen women and one juvenile were arrested during a police sting in Oakland Wednesday night targeting prostitution and human trafficking, part of an effort to get the women off the street and connected with services to help them escape the lifestyle. 11/13/2014
- Police investigations into two Redwood City massage parlors for alleged prostitution ended with the arrest of three women, police said Wednesday. 08/13/2014

Police activity is limited by resource availability. Though police forces generally have units assigned to deal with prostitution and exploitation, a lot of trafficking activity takes place over the Internet. (See Section 5.3.4)

### 5.1.4 Alameda County

Alameda County is a nationally recognized leader in combatting commercial sexual exploitation of children. A few examples of why this is true:

- Law enforcement, public defenders, staff in the district attorney's office, judges, and county officials are all trained in identifying at-risk and CSE youth.
- Girls Court, a collaboration between law enforcement and social services, links girls most at-risk for or those already forced into prostitution, to an array of social services. The judge personally oversees follow-up plans.
- At-risk and exploited youth are the focus of 10 agencies at Safety Net meetings, ensuring that safety plans are created, referrals made and that youth access services.
- Alameda County created an Assessment Center where all foster care children are processed with sensitivity, fed, given new clothes and engaged in dialogue. Three human service agencies are co-located at the Assessment Center, sitting side-by-side with County intake and placement staff. Placement planning becomes a multi-disciplinary, team effort. Information and recommendations from youth advocate case managers and mental health clinicians are discussed and considered as County staff make the best placement match possible for the child.
- A billboard and bus shelter campaign directed to victims, a collaboration involving the District Attorney, MISSSEY (service provider for CSEC) and Clear Channel, a national business, is being implemented for a second time.
- The District Attorney has prosecuted 48% of all the cases in California involving human trafficking, working closely with victims and the service providers who support the victim.
- The citizens of Oakland reauthorized funding for violence prevention programs, with special funding focused on anti-sex trafficking initiatives.

## **Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area**

### **5.2 Collaboration**

As discussed in Section 4, the role of the many task forces in the Bay Area is to bring stakeholders together to work in collaboration in carrying out the missions of the task forces and coalitions, such as to bring exploiters to justice; collect data; provide trainings and learning opportunities for member agencies, develop anti-human trafficking policies; heighten awareness of the problem of human-trafficking; implement conferences and programs; and to advocate for victim-centered approaches and services.

Law enforcement focused collaborations have been effective, especially in tracking arrests, prosecutions and legal outcomes. County task forces have also succeeded in increasing public awareness, educating the public and enhancing the knowledge of professionals in the CSE field through networking activities and conferences.

However, an important question about the many collaborations is “Do they work together?” and the answer is “Generally, no.” While most state that they work across the Bay Area, in reality the focus of most task forces is still local, except for conferences and presentations which are open to everyone. A significant exception is work focused on Super Bowl 50 in 2016, coordinated by the South Bay Coalition to End Human Trafficking.

A director of one task force said that he was aware of over 50 non-profits in the Bay Area working to fight human trafficking, exclusive of government agencies. However, an overarching, region-wide collaborative with representation from each of the task forces does not exist. Coordinating activities throughout the region could produce a bigger impact, enabling more efficient use of limited resources.

Funding is an issue for most of the task forces, with only a few receiving government support. The rest rely on voluntary contributions from member agencies of time, money and materials, plus support from foundations.

### **5.3 Reducing Demand**

Much work is being done to reduce or eliminate demand, as described below.

#### **5.3.1 Catch and Punish**

Arresting, prosecuting and punishing exploiters has the potential to destroy the business of commercial sexual exploitation. While law enforcement is getting more and more aggressive, demand still exists and is met by corresponding levels of supply.

Technology is used increasingly by law enforcement to monitor, collect, and analyze online data and activities of exploiters and buyers. The technology provides a digital trail, a valuable investigative tool for law enforcement. The DNA Foundation and Microsoft, among others, are working on creating online technologies to prevent and disrupt purchases and fulfillments of sales<sup>34</sup>

Technological advances have great potential for identifying and leading to the capture of traffickers. Results will be seen in the future.

---

<sup>34</sup> Harris, Kamala. *The State of Human Trafficking in California* 2012  
Report to the Women’s Foundation  
Prepared by Amy Rassen  
Page 26

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

### 5.3.2 Criminalizing Buying Sex

In 1999 Sweden criminalized buying sex and decriminalized prostitution. A similar law has been adopted in full by Norway and Iceland, and partly in Korea, Finland, Israel and the United Kingdom. The Swedish model recognizes that prostitution is an institution of inequality. A study ten years later showed that when Sweden banned the purchase of sex, prostitution decreased.

It is considered unlikely that such a law would be passed in the United States.

### 5.3.3 Anti-Demand Interventions

Studies indicate that anti-demand interventions can in fact reduce illegal sex trafficking.<sup>35</sup> Michael Shively was commissioned by the Justice Department to write *A National Overview of Prostitution and Sex Trafficking Demand Reduction Efforts, Final Report*. He states “there are more than a dozen distinct types of interventions that have been developed and implemented to combat demand, and variations within each type, as follows:”

- Law enforcement aimed at deterring men who might buy sex, including surveillance cameras, reverse stings, shaming by publicizing identities, suspending driver’s licenses and seizing autos
- Arresting and punishment of purchasers, followed by community service
- Public awareness/ education campaigns
- Neighborhood action tactics
- Public education and awareness programs
- Neighborhood action campaigns
- “John school” - education of buyers
- Treatment programs for arrestees

For there to be increased anti-demand interventions, the public’s understanding and outcry would need to be far greater than it is because additional interventions will require more resources to be allocated to government agencies, law enforcement and community-based agencies.

### 5.3.4 Technology-based Interventions

Digital technology has allowed many opportunities for children to be exploited for commercial gain and for adult predators to be matched with prey – children and adults. All parties use phones and/or specific sites on the Internet to advertise, recruit and connect.

According to the report released in 2013 by the Child Welfare Council, **Ending the Commercial Exploitation of Children – Call for Multi-System Collaboration in California**, the University of Southern California’s Annenberg Center on

---

<sup>35</sup> Shively, Michael, et al. *A National Overview of Prostitution and Sex Trafficking Demand Reduction Efforts, Final Report* June 2012

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

Communication Leadership & Policy (CCLP) has developed software to detect the sex trafficking of minors online.

In addition, the Demi and Ashton (DNA) Foundation's Technology Task Force comprised of top technology companies led to the creation of several programs to prevent online sexual exploitation of children. One example: Whenever an individual conducts an online search for child pornography a preventive measure is triggered.

### 5.4 Prevention

Prevention efforts are varied, some focused on deterring recruitment of potential victims, like adult presence at sites where predators hang out, such as outside group homes, detention facilities, schools in areas known for prostitution, and high-risk neighborhoods. Other efforts are directed toward building awareness by bystanders and observers so that exploiters are driven out of communities. Still other approaches are school-based, focusing on reaching vulnerable children with the highest risk factors, as well as children with low self-esteem, who feel alone, bored, or lost; or children on drugs; and those thinking there is easy money to be made (without negative consequences).

#### 5.4.1 Public Awareness

##### 5.4.1.1 Protect Oakland Kids Billboard Campaign

Alameda County District Attorney's H.E.A.T. Watch, MISSEY and Clear Channel sponsored an awareness campaign from January 2014 to the end of February 2014, throughout Oakland, using billboards above the freeway and posters on bus shelters. Messages to victims and the general public were calls to action. The goal of the general public message was to change attitudes about CSEC so that the youth would be seen as victims and not prostitutes. The goal of the messages to victims was to encourage them to get out of "the life".

Messages included:

- Teens sold for sex aren't prostitutes. They're rape victims. Come to a Child's Rescue @ ProtectOakIndKids.org.
- Buying a teen for sex is child abuse. Turning a blind eye is neglect. Help free a child@ ProtectOakIndKids.org.
- Being a prostituted teen isn't a choice. It's slavery. Set a child free@ ProtectOakIndKids.org.

By all measures the campaign was successful.<sup>36</sup>

##### 5.4.1.2 SB1193 Posters

In 2012, the California Legislature passed SB1193, to be implemented in January 2013, requiring all businesses to post a notice in a conspicuous place in clear view of the public and employees, that contains information related to slavery and human trafficking, including tip-lines to nonprofit organizations that provide services in support of the

---

<sup>36</sup> Details of results can be found on the H.E.A.T Watch website at [www.heat-watch.org](http://www.heat-watch.org).

## **Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area**

elimination of slavery and human trafficking. The transportation and services sectors affected, including hospitals, bars, strip clubs and truck stops.

Studies have shown that in other states where similar posting requirements have been enacted to engage businesses in the fight against human trafficking, there was an increase in the number of reported trafficking situations and rescues of victims.

### **5.4.2 Prevention Education**

Most experts agree that public education and awareness are critical to combating prostitution and sex trafficking. Curricula and school-based programs have these key components: education and awareness, training for adults, survivor input and referral opportunities to CSE-specialized programming.

School-based approaches are the most effective in reaching children and youth, those at-risk and students without regard to risk factors. The “My Life My Choice” curriculum educates girls and young women about CSE and shows promise in reducing the likelihood of youth entering the commercial sex industry. Other curricula are Atlanta’s Project P.R.E.V.E.N.T. (Promoting Respect, Enhancing Value, Establishing New Trust) and in Seattle, the “Powerful Voices Powerful Choices” curriculum.

In the Bay Area, several community-based organizations make presentations at schools in classrooms to students and to groups of parents at parent meetings. One agency, Love Never Fails, has developed a curriculum that is being implemented in multiple middle and high schools throughout the Bay Area. Though the organization Love Never Fails is faith-based, the curriculum is not.

School-based prevention programs directed at students as well as educators and administrators are too few, based on the need and potential impact.

### **5.4.3 Training Professionals**

Training professionals is key to their identifying at-risk boys/girls/women with whom they come in contact and understanding how to work with them. As noted, the Child Welfare Department is initiating a statewide training program for child welfare staff. In addition, a statewide work group is vetting all CSEC curricula against benchmarks and learning objectives the group has developed. The California Social Work Education Center (CalSWEC) is developing a CSEC repository of information and the California department of Social services (CDSS) may also do the same sort of online toolkit in the future.

Locally, MISSEY has trained approximately 10,000 professionals over the past seven years in CSEC 101 and is retooling its training program to add in-depth, discipline specific trainings for law enforcement, healthcare providers, educators and human service workers. Other agencies including Girls, Inc.- Alameda, Fred Finch Center and WestCoast Children’s Clinic, DreamCatchers, among others, focus on the mental health aspects of CSEC and/or providing trauma-informed care. As mentioned earlier, the Bay Area Anti-Trafficking Coalition (BAATC) trains airport personnel in the Oakland and San Jose airports how to spot traffickers and those being trafficked.

## **Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area**

A gap in this area is a focus on training staff of youth serving agencies. All work with at-risk children and youth, and, given the growing numbers of CSE, such agencies would benefit from greater knowledge and understanding of the CSE population.

### **5.5 Victim Services**

Despite robust federal laws and comprehensive child protection services, the number of people being trafficked remains surprisingly high. There are few specific services that address how to “identify, rescue, and restore victims”. While the number of organizations working with CSE has increased dramatically over the years, there are still only a few whose sole or main focus is CSE. In addition, few of the CSE-focused organization focus on adults. Most of the focus is on children and youth.

The charts in Section 6 detail the work of approximately 62 Bay Area agencies that address commercial sexual exploitation. Who is doing what and how much the organization’s work focuses on CSE is clarified in the four area-based charts.

#### **5.5.1 Crisis Response**

The National Human Trafficking Resource Center (NHTRC) is a national, toll-free hotline, available to caller from anywhere in the country, 24 hours a day, 7 days a week, every day of the year in more than 200 languages. NHTRC is not a government entity. Calls are not reported to immigration or law enforcement.

The National Center for Human Trafficking, sponsored by Polaris, connects callers to organizations in the caller’s area. Local hot-lines exist as well.

When a call is received through the national hot line or local hot lines, a first responder agency generally goes with law enforcement to the location of the caller/victim. Other circumstances, such as when law enforcement picks up someone suspected of a crime, a first responder agency also immediately intervenes. For example, Bay Area Women Against Rape in Oakland and Community Solutions in the South Bay provide these crisis response services as does Huckleberry Youth in San Francisco.

#### **5.5.2 Shelter, Group Homes, and Housing**

Shelter is a primary need of victims trying to escape from traffickers. However, there are few shelters across the country that serve only victims of trafficking. Most victims are placed in shelter or housing programs that traditionally serve victims of domestic violence and sexual assault. According to Polaris, there are only 529 beds in the US exclusively designated for human trafficking survivors. Courage House adds that there are only 10 homes in the United States for CSE children – or about 10 beds.

In the Bay Area, some domestic violence shelters also serve victims of human trafficking. Those that have been successful in serving both domestic violence and human trafficking victims have adjusted their programs for this population.

Housing designated solely for adult survivors of human trafficking is almost non-existent in the Bay Area. Only Safe House San Francisco and Mairti<sup>37</sup> provide housing with

---

<sup>37</sup> Mairti provides transitional housing for adult women.

## **Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area**

supportive services for low income, homeless, prostituted women and their children. Of note, the literature regarding adult women exiting prostitution emphasizes the importance of a therapeutic housing community to prevent relapse and build stability.

As the charts in Section 6 reflect, group homes and transitional housing for foster care youth and the 18 to 24 year old population exist. However, their focus is generally not on CSE, while their clientele includes CSE victims. Courage House, Freedom House, Huckleberry Youth, Larkin Street, First Place for Youth, Abode, Covenant House, and DreamCatchers are the Bay Area's resources for youth shelters, group homes and transitional housing.

### **5.5.3 Case Management, Therapy, Mentoring and Drop-In Centers**

Victims of human trafficking are involved with multiple agencies: law enforcement, health care providers, social service workers, legal advocates, housing personnel and others. Case managers assess the victim's needs and develop a safety plan with the victim that includes finding shelter and linkages to services. Case management is challenging because of the depth of the trauma experienced by victims and is compounded by a shortage of shelters and CSE specific services. Nevertheless, case managers work together with the victim to make a comprehensive service plan, to provide information about victim rights, to make referrals for needed services (including accompanying their clients to appointments), and most importantly, to coordinate all of the aforementioned. Case managers must be non-judgmental, accessible and supportive.

Most victims need trauma-informed short-term and long-term case management services. To deal with the trauma of their lives they also need trauma informed mental health counseling. For many, substance abuse is a problem. Studies show that mentors have a positive impact on the lives of at-risk and traumatized children and youth. Having a place to go – a drop-in center - where skills can be learned and relationships formed, free from pimps, is also a tremendous benefit to victims.

However, as the charts in Section 6 note, very few agencies in the Bay Area provide case management, mental health services, mentoring programs or drop-in programs that focus on CSE victims. MISSEY provides the only long-term case management services for youth and operates the only drop-in center for exploited girls in the Bay Area. Two other drop-in programs with a CSE focus exist in Contra-Costa County. In San Francisco, Larkin Street is open to all at-risk youth. One CSE specific mentoring program, a collaboration among MISSEY, Girl's Inc. – Alameda and the Mentoring Center, serves Alameda County CSE victims. WestCoast Children's Clinic is recognized for its expertise in counseling and short-term case management services for CSE youth. And, though not focused on this population, Community Solutions in the south bay has developed expertise in working with CSE victims as has St. James Infirmary in San Francisco.

### **5.5.4 Legal Services**

The legal needs of most domestic CSE victims can be extensive. Attorneys are needed to explain to victims their legal options and rights; educate victims about the U.S. legal

## Landscape of Efforts to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation in the Bay Area

system; and represent them in legal hearings. Many victims of domestic trafficking have had multiple contacts with the juvenile and/or adult criminal justice systems and may have been identified as the result of an arrest for prostitution, panhandling, or other crimes. Thus, they also usually need legal representation in juvenile or criminal proceedings and, in many cases, family hearings.

The Bay Area has legal aid offices in most counties whose staff serve a variety of low income residents, including CSE victims. However, only a few specialize in working with this target population.

## 6 Landscape of Services

Four charts on pages 33 to 45 can be found within this section: San Francisco City and County; Alameda County, San Mateo and Santa Clara Counties; and Coalitions. The name of the chart is on the tab at the bottom of the sheet. The information provided is presented in column form:

- Organization Name
- CSE Experience
- CSE Focus
- Trauma Informed Practice
- Sex(es) Served
- Ages Served
- Primary Location
- Primary Service Area
- Program Area
- Website

CSE Focus, CSE Experience and Trauma Informed Practice are rated based on the key at the top of each chart. For Age, C= Children; Y=Youth; T=Transition Age Youth (18 to 24); and A = Adult. Where known, a contact person has also been designated for agencies with CSE focus.

The Bay Area is service rich, but not with services focused on child or adult victims of CSE. Thus, as expected, major gaps in **victim services** exist, including:

- CSE specific shelter beds
- Drop-in centers for CSE youth
- Intensive case management for youth and adults
- Mentoring services for youth
- Volunteers trained to rescue victims

Other gaps include **school-based prevention efforts and training professionals** who come in contact with victims or those at-risk of human trafficking.